



Resources Provided to *Transforming Maternity Care* Vision Team

Maternity Care System in the United States: Relevant Systematic Reviews and Selected Other Documents

To assist the *Transforming Maternity Care* Vision Team in developing its direction-setting “2020 Vision for a High-Quality, High-Value Maternity Care System,”* members received prior to their work a compendium of systematic reviews about the effectiveness of structural and organizational components of maternity care, complemented by other better quality evidence, identified as such, when systematic reviews were not available. The items, referenced below, were published through April 2008 and covered such topics as models for providing maternity care, cadres of professionals who care for childbearing families, and settings where maternity care is provided. The items were derived from Childbirth Connection’s decade-long work to compile and disseminate systematic reviews on the effectiveness of all aspects of maternity care, through its online evidence-based maternity care resource directory, quarterly evidence columns published simultaneously in two peer-reviewed clinical care journals, and other work.

As an update on evidence supporting specific forms of clinical care, members received a pre-publication copy of the Milbank Report, [Evidence-Based Maternity Care: What It Is and What It Can Achieve](#). These background resources were intended to help ground the ensuing vision statement in a foundation of best available evidence. For the resulting 2020 Vision paper, the subsequent Blueprint for Action paper charting the path toward the vision, companion documents, and to learn more about the *Transforming Maternity Care* project, visit www.childbirthconnection.org/tmc/

Pre- and Interconceptional Care

Korenbrot CC, Steinberg A, Bender C, Newberry S. Preconception care: A systematic review. *Matern Child Health J* 2002 Jun;6(2):75-88.

Not systematic review: dilemma: we don't know what health system approaches work

Atrash HK, Johnson K, Adams M, Cordero JF, Howse J. Preconception care for improving perinatal outcomes: The time to act. *Matern Child Health J* 2006;10(suppl):S3-S11. [most relevant paper in special issue from CDC project: calls for action, cites guidelines, but only cites Korenbrot as evidence]

Providers of Maternity Care

Brown SA, Grimes DE. A meta-analysis of nurse practitioners and nurse midwives in primary care. *Nurs Res* 1995 Nov-Dec;44(6):332-9.

* Carter MC, Corry M, Delbanco S and other members of the Transforming Maternity Care Vision Team. 2020 vision for a high-quality, high-value maternity care system. *Women's Health Issues* 2010;20(1 supplement):S7-S17. Available at: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/issue/5192-2010-999799998.8998-1591119>

Hatem M, Sandall J, Devane D, Soltani H. Midwifery-led versus other models of care for childbearing women. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* [3/08 undergoing final sign-off process with Editorial team; not published yet but in press version may be available to inform CC symposium]

Khan-Neelofur D, Gülmezoglu M, Villar J. WHO Antenatal Care Trial Research Group. Who should provide routine antenatal care for low-risk women, and how often? A systematic review of randomised controlled trials. *Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol* 1998 Oct;12(suppl 2):7-26.

Waldenström U, Turnbull D. A systematic review comparing continuity of midwifery care with standard maternity services. *Br J Obstet Gynaecol* 1998 105(11):1160-70.

Walsh D, Downe SM. Outcomes of free-standing, midwife-led birth centers: a structured review. *Birth* 2004 Sep;31(3):222-9.

Notable but not systematic review

Gussman D. Hospitalists review essay. n.d. Available without charge at: <http://www.oblaborist.org/studies.php> [impressive theoretical advantages for diverse stakeholders of laborist care in comparison with usual care, but limited comparative data]

Klein M. The effectiveness of family practice maternity care: A cross-cultural and environmental view. *Primary Care* 1993;20(3):523-36. [most recent narrative review of family physician provision of maternity care; thoughtful interpretation]

Prenatal Care

Khan-Neelofur D, Gülmezoglu M, Villar J. WHO Antenatal Care Trial Research Group. Who should provide routine antenatal care for low-risk women, and how often? A systematic review of randomised controlled trials. *Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol* 1998 Oct;12(suppl 2):7-26.

Villar J, Carroli G, Khan-Neelofur D, Piaggio G, Gülmezoglu M. Patterns of routine antenatal care for low-risk pregnancy. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2001;(4):CD000934.

Notable but not systematic review

Ickovics JR, Kershaw TS, Westdahl C, Magriples U, Massey Z, Reynolds H, Rising SS. Group prenatal care and perinatal outcomes: A randomized controlled trial. *Obstet Gynecol* 2007 110(2 Pt 1):330-9. [Currently replicated in 14 community health centers and community hospitals, under NIH grant.]

Walker DS, Worrell R. Promoting healthy pregnancies through perinatal groups: A comparison of Centering Pregnancy® group prenatal care and childbirth education classes. *J Perinat Educ* 2008 17(1):27-34. [Informal review of Centering evaluations and discussion of degree to which Centering encompasses or complements childbirth education]

Childbirth Education and Help with Making Informed Decisions

Gagnon AJ, Sandall J. Individual or group antenatal education for childbirth or parenthood, or both. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2007 Jul 18;(3):CD002869.

Koehn ML. Childbirth education outcomes: An integrative review of the literature. *J Perinat Educ* 2002 11(3):10-19.

O'Connor AM, Bennett C, Stacey D, Barry MJ, Col NF, Eden KB, Entwistle V, Fiset V, Holmes-Rovner M, Khangura S, Llewellyn-Thomas H, Rovner DR. Do patient decision aids meet effectiveness criteria of the international patient decision aid standards collaboration? A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Med Decis Making* 2007 Sep-Oct;27(5):554-74. [generic, not focused on maternity care]

O'Connor AM, Stacey D, Entwistle V, Llewellyn-Thomas H, Rovner D, Holmes-Rovner M, Tait V, Tetroe J, Fiset V, Barry M, Jones J. Decision aids for people facing health treatment or screening decisions. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2003;(2):CD001431. [generic, not focused on maternity care]

Neither systematic review nor specific to maternity care

Matiasek J, Wynia MK. Reconceptualizing the informed consent process at eight innovative hospitals. *Joint Commission J Qual Patient Safety* 2008 34(3):127-37.

Woolf SH, Chan EC, Harris R, Sheridan SL, Braddock CH 3rd, Kaplan RM, Krist A, O'Connor AM, Tunis S. Promoting informed choice: Transforming health care to dispense knowledge for decision making. *Ann Intern Med* 2005;143(4):293-300.

Place of Birth

Muthu V, Fischbacher C. Free-standing midwife-led maternity units: a safe and effective alternative to hospital delivery for low-risk women? *Evidence-Based Healthcare Public Health*, 2004 8(6):325-31.

Olsen O. Meta-analysis of the safety of home birth. *Birth* 1997 Mar;24(1):4-13; discussion 14-6.

Stewart M, McCandlish R, Henderson J, Brocklehurst P. Report of a structured review of birth centre outcomes. Oxford: National Perinatal Epidemiology Unit, December 2004. Available without charge at: <http://www.npeu.ox.ac.uk/birthcentrereview>

Walsh D, Downe SM. Outcomes of free-standing, midwife-led birth centers: a structured review. *Birth* 2004 Sep;31(3):222-9.

Narrative home birth reviews

Fullerton JT, Navarro AM, Young SH. Outcomes of planned home birth: an integrative review. *J Midwifery Womens Health* 2007;52(4):323-333.

Stotland NE, Declercq ER. Safety of out-of-hospital birth in industrialized nations: A review. *Curr Probs Obstet Gynecol Fertil* 2002;25:134-44.

Narrative review about health care environment

Ulrich R, Quan X, Zimring C, Joseph A, Choudhary R. *The Role of the Physical Environment in the Hospital of the 21st Century: A Once-in-a Lifetime Opportunity*. Report to The Center for Health Design for the *Designing the 21st Century Hospital Project*, September 2004. [With companion documents: 1) Abstracts table supplement, May 2005. 2) The Center for Health Design. Scorecards for evidence based-design.] Available without charge at:
http://www.healthdesign.org/research/reports/physical_envirn.php

Labor Support and Early Mother-Baby Skin-to-Skin Contact

Hodnett ED, Gates S, Hofmeyr GJ, Sakala C. Continuous support for women during childbirth. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2007 Jul 18;(3):CD003766.

Moore ER, Anderson GC, Bergman N. Early skin-to-skin contact for mothers and their healthy newborn infants. *Cochrane Database Sys Rev* 2007 Jul 18;(3):CD003519.

Postpartum Care

Demott K, Bick D, Norman R, Ritchie G, Turnbull N, Adams C et al. *Clinical guidelines and evidence review for post natal care: Routine post natal care of recently delivered women and their babies*. London: National Collaborating Centre for Primary Care and Royal College of General Practitioners, 2006. 393p. Available without charge and with numerous companion documents at <http://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/CG37> [many related documents at <http://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/index.jsp?action=byID&o=10988> including Quick Reference Guide summary without mention of quality of underlying evidence]

Promoting Breastfeeding Initiation and Duration

Britton C, McCormick FM, Renfrew MJ, Wade A, King SE. Support for breastfeeding mothers. *Cochrane Database Sys Rev* 2007 (1):CD001141.

Couto de Oliveira MI, Bastos Camacho LA, Tedstone AE. Extending breastfeeding duration through primary care: a systematic review of prenatal and postnatal interventions. *J Hum Lact* 2001;17(4):326-43.

Dyson L, McCormick F, Renfrew MJ. Interventions for promoting the initiation of breastfeeding. *Cochrane Database Sys Rev* 2005 (2):CD001688.

Guise J-M, Palda V, Westhoff C, Chan BKS, Helfand M, Lieu TA. The effectiveness of primary care-based interventions to promote breastfeeding: systematic evidence review and meta-analysis for the US Preventive Services Task Force. *Ann Fam Med*

2003;1(2):70-78. Available without charge and with companion documents at:
<http://www.annfammed.org/content/vol1/issue2/index.shtml>

Renfrew M, Dyson L, Wallace L, D'Souza L, McCormick F, Spiby H. *The effectiveness of public health interventions to promote the duration of breastfeeding: Systematic review, parts 1 and 2*. London: National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence, May 2005. Available without charge at:
http://www.nice.org.uk/aboutnice/howeare/aboutthehda/hdapublications/hda_publications.jsp?o=757 and
http://www.nice.org.uk/aboutnice/howeare/aboutthehda/hdapublications/hda_publications.jsp?o=750

Sikorski J, Renfrew MJ, Pindoria S, Wade A. Support for breastfeeding mothers: A systematic review. *Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol* 2003;17(4):404-17.

Prenatal and Postpartum Home Visiting

Ciliska D, Mastrilli P, Ploeg J, Hayward S, Brunton G, Underwood J. The effectiveness of home visiting as a delivery strategy for public health nursing interventions to clients in the prenatal and postnatal period: A systematic review. *Prim Health Care Res Dev* 2001;2:41-54.

Maternity Care Quality Improvement

Chaillet N, Dubé E, Dugas M, Audibert F, Tourigny C, Fraser WD, Dumont A. Evidence-based strategies for implementing guidelines in obstetrics: a systematic review. *Obstet Gynecol* 2006 Nov;108(5):1234-45.

Chaillet N, Dumont A. Evidence-based strategies for reducing cesarean section rates: a meta-analysis. *Birth* 2007 Mar;34(1):53-64.

NOTE: There are dozens of systematic reviews on various quality improvement strategies without specific reference to maternity care. Many are listed on Childbirth Connection's website at <http://www.childbirthconnection.org/article.asp?ck=10322>
Topics include: audit and feedback, continuing education, guidelines, computerized reminders, opinion leaders, and teaching critical appraisal.

Health Professionalism in the Twenty-First Century (not systematic reviews)

ABIM Foundation, ACP-ASIM Foundation, European Federation of Internal Medicine. Medical professionalism in the new millenium: A physician charter. *Ann Int Med* 2002;136(3):243-6.

Dawes M, Summerskill W, Glasziou P, Cartabellotta A, Martin J, Hopayian K, Porzsolt F, Burls A, Osborne J. Sicily statement on evidence-based practice. *BMC Medical Educ* 2005 5:1

Bibliography prepared on April 1, 2008